

**3<sup>rd</sup> External Evaluation Report  
December 2016**

## **REPORT ON IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROJECT**

### **Overall achievements**

The Tempus Project InterEULawEast was launched in February 2014. During its implementation period, several activities were organised including four international conferences devoted to “Legal reform and EU enlargement – transfer of experiences” (WP 5), summer courses on EU internal market law and EU company law (WP 3) and a series of guest lectures for advanced master students (WP 1). The project resulted in curricula development in international and EU law (WP 1) and the introduction of new master programmes in European and international in both Russia and Ukraine (WP 1 and 4). In addition, three Tempus Centres (in Zagreb, Voronezh and Odessa) were opened (WP 2) and the journal InterEULawEast was launched. In terms of project management (WP 6), the coordinators responded flexibly to external factors (such as the crisis in Ukraine) and internal challenges (such as accreditation requirements in Russia and Ukraine and changes in the legal status and management of one EU partner (Socialo Tehnologiju Augstskola) (for further comments, see also previous evaluation reports).

In the year 2016, further progress was made with respect to project implementation. Of particular significance was the formal launch of the new Master Programme in International and European Law at Tuymen State University (WP4) and the dissemination of new course material (handbooks and a glossary of EU internal market terminology (WP 5), open accession via <http://iele.weebly.com/books.html>). Efforts were made to improve curriculum development in line with the Bologna process (WP 1 and 3). As far as dissemination is concerned (WP5), all activities of the consortium are regularly published on the project’s umbrella website. In addition, the webpages of all co-beneficiary institutions cross-refer to the project’s website. A new issue of the InterEULawEast Journal for International and European Law was published in June 2016 and initiatives were developed to ensure the sustainability of the journal after the end of the project’s lifetime. Of particular significance is the guaranteed co-financing on behalf of the Croatian Ministry of Science and Education and the process to include the journal in an internationally recognised index of academic journals. In terms of project management (WP 6), project coordination meetings were organised in Zagreb and Maribor. In addition, the project coordinator and the co-beneficiary institutions entertain frequent contacts to ensure the smooth implementation of the project. Mechanisms for internal and external quality control (WP 5) are established and function in accordance with the work programme. In agreement with the EACEA, the project deadline has been extended with six months (until 31/5/2017) allowing for additional guest lectures and workshops and an evaluation of the new master programmes (including student’s feedback). This should also allow to ensure the sustainability of the project’s results after the end of the funding period.

### **Coherence with the workplan and comments on deviations and modifications**

Following the annexation of Crimea, the envisaged participation of Taurida National V.I. Vernadsky University (TNU) has been suspended. The project coordinators made the necessary arrangements in cooperation with the EACEA. As a result of the occupation of the Donbas region, the seat of Donetsk National University moved to the city of Vinnitsa. The required adaptations to the workplan and initial project proposal have been discussed with the EACEA and the project coordinators adequately amended the initial workplan (see also previous evaluation reports).

Apart from these external factors, which are clearly outside the control of the participating institutions, the project also struggled with internal problems in one of the EU partners, i.e. the Socialo Tehnologiju Augstskola (STA), Riga. Despite attempts to seek a more active involvement of STA, changes in legal status and management implied that this partner did not implement its commitments as foreseen under the initial workplan. The other partners therefore decided to halt their part of the budget and to formally request for a re-allocation of the reserved money to the University of Zagreb as project co-ordinator so

that it can be used for further activities (such as guest lectures and evaluation activities) during the 6-months extension of the project's lifetime. The University of Maribor organised the final conference, which was planned to take place in Riga.

All changes to the workplan have been communicated to the EACEA and there is full transparency of the modifications. At the end of August 2016, a revised workplan was sent to the EACEA indicating in detail the proposed activities for all working packages for the period between 1 December 2016 – 31 May 2017.

### **Obstacles and shortcomings**

Most obstacles and shortcomings identified in the previous evaluation reports (non-participation of STA, issues regarding accreditation of new master programmes and implementation of the scholarship programme) have been adequately addressed. The budget and tasks attributed to STA have been re-allocated (see previous point), a new master programme was launched at the University of Tuymen and, notwithstanding certain practical problems in terms of visa issuing and last minute cancellations, the scholarship programme is in place and students could benefit from this opportunity to obtain ECTS credits abroad.

### **Development of programmes and courses**

New master programmes in European and International Law were prepared for Russian and Ukrainian partner universities. In this context, the project resulted in the publication of series of handbooks (on citizenship of the Union, on free provision of services in the internal market and on the EU system of legal remedies) as well as a glossary of EU internal market law terminology and a general textbook on the law of the European Union. All course material is open access and is presented in a student-friendly manner so that it can be used for interactive methods of teaching. It is advisable to organise an evaluation of the manuals based upon the student's experiences and National Erasmus + Offices in order to assess the project outputs in light of the national educational system, labour market needs and student expectations. Such an additional quality control is scheduled to take place in the period between December 2016 and April 2017, as foreseen under the revised workplan (WP 7). It is advisable to publish also the full ECTS files for the courses on offer and a link to all master programmes resulting from the project.

### **Restructuring: university management and governance**

The project resulted in the opening of three Tempus centra, in Zagreb, Odessa and Voronezh in full accordance with the objectives under WP 2.

### **Staff (re-)training**

Staff of the participating institutions discussed the implementation of the project and exchanged best practices on the occasion of conferences organised in Zagreb (March 2016) and Maribor (July 2016).

On 6 December 2016, the Zagreb Tempus team and Voronezh Tempus team took part in the international information and methodological seminar "Capacity building in the field of Higher Education" in Moscow, organised by the National Erasmus Plus Office in Russia. This allowed the participants to discuss the implementation of the project with representatives of several Russian academic institutions.

### **Staff mobility**

On 15th and 16th February 2016 Professor Rajko Knez, Faculty of Law of University of Maribor gave two lectures - Developments in the EU and contemporary jurisprudence of the EU Court of Justice - during his visit as guest lecturer at the Institute of State and Law of Tyumen State University. Around 100 students attended the lectures.

On 21st October 2016, the Zagreb Tempus team visited National University Odessa Law Academy and took part in the International Scientific and Practical Conference: Contemporary Legal Education – Experience of the Past and a View for the Future. Professor Horak and Assistant Poljanec held lectures on „Law Schools in the 21st Century – the Role, Perspectives and Challenges“. The aim of the presentation was to show and discuss new tendencies in the legal education – innovation, interdisciplinarity, orientation towards students, importance of student and staff exchanges as well as importance of dialogue among academia and practice. Mrs Željka Pitner, from the International Relations Office of the University of Zagreb, held lecture on new possibilities of exchange within Erasmus Plus projects.

The organisation of guest lectures in Donetsk or Vinnista where DBU is temporarily located were postponed because of numerous difficulties due to civil disturbance.

### **Student mobility**

Students of the different partner universities are widely associated to the project. They took part in the international quality committees of each partner and in the organization of the conferences and events in Zagreb, Maribor, Voronezh, Tyumen, Kazan and Donetsk.

On 22th February 2016, the University of Zagreb organised an introductory orientation day for 9 incoming students within the scholarship mechanism. Students were introduced to basic aspects of the Tempus programme and criteria of studying at Bachelor Degree in Business Programme. Students have been chosen on basis of rigorous competition and selection procedure based on criteria of excellence at partner universities in Russia and Ukraine (two students from TSU, un from KFU, two from VSU, two from DNU and two from NU OLA). The students successfully passed a two-months study programme, obtained ECTS credits and final grades, took part in the 3<sup>rd</sup> conference on legal reform and EU enlargement, prepared three students papers for the journal and visited bot the Croatian Parliament and the Commercial Court.

### **Academic co-ordination and administrative management**

The coordination of the project is under the direction of professor Hana Horak from Zagreb university. The Interlaw management group of the project includes representatives from different partners universities (two representatives for Zagreb, one for the other partners). The management group is responsible for methodological, organizational and financial management, development of strategic decision-making on project implementation, mid-term reviews, progressive planning and potential adjustments. Tasks are clearly divided between the different partners, with more or less involvement (see logical matrix reports of the project). The internet site of the project provides very clear and very complete information about the organization of the consortium, the different tasks given to the university partners and the aims of the project.

From the European side, the representatives of the universities of Zagreb (Prof. Horak and her team) and Maribor (Prof. Rajko Knez and his team) have been the driving forces behind the project whereas the involvement of the third partner (Socialo Technologiju Augustskola) was very limited. Eventually, this third partner decided to leave the project. Because almost the whole budget allocated to the Latvian

partner was not used, Prof. Hana Horak made a request for the reallocation of money in line with the request for extension of the project until spring 2017.

Notwithstanding the difficulties resulting from the conflict in the eastern part of Ukraine (see above), academic co-operation with the Russian and Ukrainian partners developed smoothly.

### **Equipment**

The project allowed for the opening of three Tempus centres in Zagreb, Voronezh and Odessa. The issue of purchase of equipment for Donetsk National University, Tyumen State University and Kazan Federal University has been discussed with the project coordinator which gave clear instructions on the procedures to be followed. Most of the equipment was bought for the Tempus centres in Voronezh and Odessa, for almost the same amount of money. At this time there is no indication about the money spent to buy equipment for the Donetsk university team.

### **Dissemination**

Dissemination activities essentially concerned the organisation of academic activities in Zagreb, Maribor, Kazan, Voronezh, Tyumen and Odessa (October 2016) as well as the publication of open access course material (handbooks, glossary and textbook). Moreover, a ‘project book’ including a detailed overview of the project’s objectives and achievements has been published on the project’s dedicated website (<http://iele.weebly.com/>). All the partners are fully involved – but at different levels – in the dissemination of the project.

In 2016 four new textbooks were published: Law of the European union (editors, Pavel Biriukov, Viacheslav Tuliakov, VSU Publishing House, Voronezh); Glossary of European Union Internal Market Terminology. Amended to Include the Association Agreement between the European Union and Ukraine (Tuliakov V.O. Pashkovskiy M.I., Barskiy V.R., Katsyn M.Y., Alekseeva I.M, publishers: Feniks, Odessa); Handbook on System of Legal Remedies in the EU (Rajko Knej, Pravna fakulteta Univerze v Mariboru); Handbook on Free Provision of Services on the Internal Market (Rajko Knej, Publisher: Pravna fakulteta Univerze v Mariboru); Handbook on Citizenship of the Union (Rajko Knej, Pravna fakulteta Univerze v Mariboru).

Dissemination also concerns the publication of the review “InterEUlawEast – Journal for International and European Law, Economics and Market Integrations”. The journal collects papers from the area of Law and Economics, with an emphasis on international law, law of European Union and economic and legal aspects of market integrations. It is published twice a year, in June and December, in both printed and electronic edition, and allows free access to published articles through the review website. The fifth issue was published in June 2016. The partners have discussions about negotiations with Scopus concerning the indexation of the journal, and – more important – to continue this publication after the end of the Tempus project. For this purpose, financial support was found with Croatian Ministry of Science and Education.

### **Sustainability**

The objective of the Tempus project was the creation of a common master programme in European and international law. Due to different national legislations in Russia and Ukraine, the consortium delivered two master programmes, one for the Russian and one for the Ukrainian co-beneficiaries. The programmes are supposed to continue after the EU’s financial assistance has ended. In a very difficult international context, the different partner universities managed to progress in the process of establishing the new degrees in line with the Bologna requirements. The creation of the new master programmes, very original in the landscape of superior education in Russia and Ukraine, is of course essential for the sustainability of

the project. It was crucial to carefully monitor the local accreditation procedures, which has been launched in 2015 for the beginning of the programmes in 2016.

In June 2014, a Memorandum of Understanding was signed between the University of Zagreb and Voronezh State University. In 2015 another Memorandum of Understanding was signed between Donetsk National University and Faculty of Economics and Business University of Zagreb and National University Odessa Law Academy and Faculty of Economics and Business University of Zagreb. In November 201 the official signing of the Partnership Agreement between Russian co- beneficiaries and Project Coordinator was organized. The agreement governs organisational and financial aspects of the project implementation.

Local accreditation procedures for the master programmes at Voronezh and Odessa universities ended in July 2015; for the Universities of Kazan and Tyumen this procedure finished in the beginning of 2016.

An important challenge for the success and sustainability of the project concerns the establishment of a scholarship mechanism. 10 scholarships have been provided by the University of Zagreb. On 19th February 2016 students arrived in Zagreb and on 22th February 2016 introductory class took place (see above).

The revision of the working plan until 31 May of 2017 serves the sustainability of the project. It aims to address the problems and delays due to difficult international circumstances.

### **Quality control and monitoring**

All representatives of the partner universities were introduced to the goals and conditions of participation in the Tempus project. They are also involved in the implementation of the project objectives, curriculum development, and dissemination activities. In addition to the external quality control, there is an internal evaluation committee with representatives from the partner universities. So far, seven logical framework matrix reports have been published on the project website.

### **Gender balance**

The project is organized and managed by women and men in almost equal proportions. The Tempus Project Coordinator is a woman.